

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Centre for
Accreditation and Quality Assurance
in Education and Healthcare
January 20, 2024

**REPORT
OF AN EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM 7R01115 “GENERAL
SURGERY” OF THE CORPORATE FUND
“UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER”
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS (RESIDENCE SPECIALTIES)
OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

external expert evaluation period: November 27-29, 2023

Astana, 2023

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”	6
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”	8
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”	38
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	39
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational program of residency in the specialty of educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”	40
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	41

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AMP – administrative and managerial personnel
SCES – state compulsory educational standard
Department – Department of Education of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre”
End-of-course assessment – end-of-course assessment
IEP - individual educational plan
RW - research work
CF "UMC" - corporate foundation "University Medical Centre"
CED – catalogue of elective disciplines
MOH RK – Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO – Medical Educational Organization
MHES RK – Ministry of Higher Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTB – material and technical base
R&D – scientific research work
NRCMC – National Research Centre for Motherhood and Childhood
PE – postgraduate education
CDP – continuing professional development
RT – retraining
Academic staff - academic staff
EP – educational programs
RDC – Republican Diagnostic Centre
WC - working curriculum
NCIE - National centre for independent examination
QMS – quality management system
IWRT - work of a resident doctor under the supervision of a clinical mentor during the period of clinical activities of a resident doctor
IWR – independent work of a resident doctor
EMC - educational and methodological council
EMCD – educational and methodological complexes of disciplines
GPA – Grade Point Average - the arithmetic average of the grades received for all courses completed, taking into account the time spent on them
JCI – Joint Commission International
UPMC – University of Pittsburgh Medical Centre
MUSM – School of Medicine of Nazarbayev University

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 26 dated November 8, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" during the period November 27-29, 2023, consisting of the following members:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the NGO "Surgical Association of the Karaganda Region", member of the International Society of Surgeons (International Surgery Society), member of the "Association of Independent Experts of Astana" and the "Union of Independent Experts of KSMU".
2	International expert	Ziganshina Liliya Yevgenevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Epidemiology of the Russian Medical Academy of Continuing Professional Education, Director of Cochrane Russia. Member of the WHO Committee on the Selection and Use of Essential Medicines. Laureate of the State Prize of the Republic of Tatarstan in the field of science and technology for the work "Development and implementation in healthcare practice of the Republic of Tatarstan of a new technology for the selection and rational use of drugs - the formulary system."
3	International expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Cardio Rheumatology of the Institution "National Research Centre for Maternal and Child Health" of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic (MHKR), Chief Rheumatologist of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Vice-President of the Association of Rheumatologists of Central Asia and Kazakhstan
4	Academic expert	Zhantelieva Lyazzat Asanovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Research JSC "Scientific Centre of Urology named after. B.U.Dzharbusynov"
5	Academic expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a course of anaesthesiology and resuscitation National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
6	Academic expert	Idrisov Alisher Saugabaevich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Family Medicine No. 2 NJSC "Astana Medical University"

7	Academic expert	Menchisheva Yulia Alexandrovna	Doctor PhD, Head of the Department of Surgical Dentistry of NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after. S.D.Asfendiyarov"
8	Academic expert	Ramazanova Sholpan Khamzaevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Childhood Diseases named after N.A. Barlybaeva NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
9	Academic expert	Dolmatova Irina Anatolyevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, acting Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
10	Academic expert	Arinova Saule Pasevnoevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the Karaganda Medical University NJSC
11	Academic expert	Karibaeva Dina Orynbasarovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department Fundamental Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi
12	Academic expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, assistant Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine named after Professor Pruglo Yu.V. NJSC "Semey Medical University"
13	Resident expert	Orynbay Aizere Sauletkyzy	resident of the second year of study in the specialty "General Surgery" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University"
14	Resident expert	Yerkinov Yerbolat	Resident of the first year of study in the specialty "Angiosurgery, including children's" LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre". Resident of the surgical community "Veritas" NJSC "Astana Medical University"

The EEC report includes a description of the results and conclusion of an external evaluation of the educational program 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational institutions and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational accreditation programs and guidelines for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY"

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" BIN: 151040018391
Government	JSC "Nazarbayev University"
Full name of the first manager	Pya Yuri Vladimirovich
Date of creation	September 20, 2015
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, 010000 "Yesil" district, Astana

	st. Kerey, Zhanibek khandar, 5/1
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	Kyzylorda branch of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre"
Year of commencement of the accredited educational program (EP)	2022
Duration of training	3 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	There was no release
Number of residents in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	7 residents
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of the educational program	The total number of teachers is 3, including full-time teachers - 3, part-time teachers - 0. Sedateness, 33.3% - 1 Categorical, 33.3% - 1%
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	www.umc.org.kz

At the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre”, training in the residency specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” was started for the first time in 2022. The total contingent of the specialty was 7 residents. It should be noted that when entering residency, the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre” sets higher requirements. Persons who have certificates of passing a foreign language test (for example, IELTS at least 6.0, TOEFL at least 560 points) are awarded the highest score on a 100-point grading system. In view of the fact that the clinical bases of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" are scientific centres, the organization of the educational process is built taking into account the specifics of the work of these medical organizations. Nevertheless, in the implementation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” there is complete integration of education, science and practice. This is reflected in the internal regulatory documents of the fund.

The administrative staffs responsible for the implementation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” include employees of the Department of Education under the leadership of Director Alma Alibekovna Syzdykova.

The Academic staff conducting residency training in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” consists of three full-time doctors of the National Research Centre for Maternity and Childhood, one of whom has a Ph.D. degree, one has a higher category in the specialty of surgery. All teaching staff have completed advanced training courses in pedagogy. The organization pays attention to the constant professional growth of teaching staff and motivates research work.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

To date, accreditation of the educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” has not been carried out.

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”

The self-assessment report for the residency educational program in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” is presented on 147 pages of main text, 78-page appendices, copies or

electronic versions of 21 documents, located at https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1VnNmI - pZJkoP16pgiHjoggnslA_kePco.

The report contains answers to all 9 main accreditation standards; the structure complies with the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as the internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the Chairman of the Board, Doctor of Medical Sciences Pya Yuri Vladimirovich, which confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 9 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibilities of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational program.

Self-assessment of the educational program 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" was carried out on the basis of order No. 08-n/k dated June 01, 2023 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for specialized accreditation of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre".

All standards contain the actual practice of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" in training residents in the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" taking into account the start of admission of students in 2022, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated regarding the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, results of evaluation of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the university and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, database), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is presented to ECAQA in complete form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain links in the text and are continuously numbered.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA / Dates of visit to the organization: November 27-29, 2023 Schedule of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in Annex 3 to this report.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 5 people;
- interviews with residents – 46 people, including 7 residents of the educational program in specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY"; study of the website www.umc.org.kz;
- interviewing 17 employees: 10 teachers, 7 mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents - 117 and 211, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attendance at one seminar (Master class on laparoscopic technique), 3 residents in the specialty of paediatric surgery 2 years of training, simulation class of the National Research Centre for Maternity and Childhood), attendance at a journal club meeting
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: 5 practice/clinical engagement centres were visited, including the National Research Centre for Maternity and Childhood, where training is provided in 9 educational programs with the participation of 117 full-time teachers/part-time teachers;

- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 21 units, both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, talks with members of the EEC

№	Position	Quantity
1	Meeting with the management of the CF "University Medical Centre" - Chairman of the Board – Professor Pya Yuri Vladimirovich. - Deputy Chairman of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" - Khamzina N..	2
2	Meeting with the Director of the Department of Education Alma Alibekovna Syzdykova	1
3	Meeting with managers of additional education Olkhovik Svetlana Vladimirovna, Shintaeva Sabira	2
4	Meeting with department directors 1) with the director of the Department of Paediatric Surgery – Dzhenaev Damir Bulatovich 2) with acting Director of the Department of Surgery - Bikhanov Nurzhan Aktleuovich 3) Director of the Department of Anaesthesiology and Intensive Care – Ibraev Talgat Yergalievich	3
5	Interviews with residents of the 1st year of study, including two residents in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”	46
6	Interview with teaching staff in surgical specialties of the residency, including 3 teaching staff conducting training in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”	17
7	Meeting with representatives of support services (human resources, financial sector)	4
8	Meeting with the teacher conducting training at the simulation centre	1

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external assessment. A final discussion was held on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, talks, and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external assessment are made. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.” No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed and the chairman, MD. Yermek Turgunov held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized, and each member of the commission was provided with a personal computer with access to all supporting documents. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the Corporate Fund, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

When conducting a survey of residents, the majority of respondents (73.75%, 59 people out of 80 respondents) believe that it is necessary to accredit an educational organization or educational programs.

According to 81.25% (26) of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission statement

During the implementation of program activities, namely, based on the results of an interview with the Chairman of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre", the Director of the Department of Education, members of the educational and methodological council, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established. All participants in the educational process are not all know the mission of the educational program and did not participate in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission. The mission is brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations. The organization's strategic plan for the period 2019-2023 was reviewed (approved by the decision of the Board of Trustees of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" dated May 25, 2019), including such areas as "outstanding quality and innovation in the provision of patient-centred and family-oriented medical care", "outstanding quality in the field of medical science, education and practical training of healthcare professionals", "integration of medical care, research and educational activities", "effective corporate governance system", which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and organization prospects. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases.

During the visit to the departments of the educational organization, experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational program, including: motivation of residents to participate in prestigious international conferences with an oral or poster presentation, motivation to publish in co-authorship or as the first author or corresponding author in journals indexed by Web of Science and Scopus, creating comfortable conditions for mastering practical skills, including visiting the simulation centre of the School of Medicine of Nazarbayev University, having access to all bibliographic databases of scientific literature and the library, timely conducting advanced training courses in the specialty and in pedagogy among Teaching staff conducting training in residency specialties, motivation of Academic staff for scientific activities, creation and implementation of scientific projects.

The corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" operates units that are directly related to the educational program 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" which can be noted as good clinical practice in the training of surgical residents. This conclusion was made on the basis that the Academic staff providing training in the GENERAL SURGERY residency program are leading experts in their field and carry out technically complex planned surgical interventions.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”, as well as the educational process, are built in accordance with the State Standards of Education and Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and healthcare. At the same time, during meetings with teachers and residents, experts identified a number of problems, including the lack of an electronic,

automated system for assessing the educational achievements of a resident physician, the lack of an electronic test database and an implemented system for determining the validity and reliability of test tasks, the lack of the necessary equipment or phantoms for practicing practical skills in surgery.

The educational organization conducts training for residents at the following clinical sites and departments: JSC “National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Center”, JSC “National Center for Neurosurgery”, “National Research Center for Maternity and Childhood”, Republican Diagnostic Center, departments of therapeutic and surgical profiles, as well as in the department of radiology and nuclear medicine, where a patient-oriented approach is provided through the integrity, consistency and continuity of the treatment and diagnostic process, informing the patient about all the details of the treatment and diagnostic process, creating comfortable conditions for the patient to stay in the process of providing him with medical care, providing emotional support in regarding the patient, taking into account his needs and preferences. The educational organization pays due attention to the safety and autonomy of patients by improving the system of clinical training of students of the CF "UMC", analyzing and analyzing complex clinical cases of scientific, educational and practical interest, developing proposals for improving the system of medical care, clinical training, scientific research and patient safety. From October 20 to October 23, 2014, the Center successfully passed accreditation by the Joint Commission International in accordance with international standards of quality and patient safety. The Director for Quality Management and Patient Safety of CF "UMC" periodically plans and coordinates the improvement of management systems, issues of improving the quality of services provided, and conducting internal audits.

Experts have established that residents have appropriate working conditions to support their own health, since the educational organization provides instruction, which includes demonstration of safe work practices, as well as working hours, working conditions, health and safety issues in the workplace, and the use of equipment personal protection (wearing protective clothing), safety signs, electrical safety, actions in case of accidents and other incidents.

Basic competencies of residents in an accredited specialty, such as formulating a clinical diagnosis, interpreting laboratory and instrumental research methods, conducting treatment and rehabilitation of patients, interacting with patients and medical professionals, as well as special competencies, including formulating research questions, critically evaluating professional literature, effectively using international databases in their daily activities, participation in the work of a research team, help educational organizations apply innovative forms of teaching. This will allow residents to develop such skills and qualities as the ability to obtain information about the patient, detail complaints, conduct objective research, be capable of critical perception of conflicting ideas, independently and effectively solve problems in the field of professional activity, have a broad outlook and be aware of themselves and their responsibility in modern society, have a scientific understanding of a healthy lifestyle, possess skills and development skills, have a communicative culture, be able to continuously learn throughout life, be ready to effectively and efficiently provide medical care to the population, make decisions based on the principles of evidence-based medicine, be able to apply scientific advances in medicine, apply management principles to the organization and implementation of medical care, have teamwork skills and leadership qualities.

Experts determined that mainly employees and teaching staff participated in the development of the mission and final learning outcomes at CF “UMC”.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts have determined that the formation of professionalism includes the development of practical skills with the achievement of final learning outcomes, such as: patient supervision, communication and collaboration, safety and quality, public health, research, training and development; performance of competencies - patient care, medical knowledge, practice-oriented learning and improvement, communication skills, professionalism, system-based practice, and the resident's ability to demonstrate high standards of ethical behaviour, demonstrate compassion, responsiveness to the needs of patients beyond self-interest, integrity and respect for others, acceptance of personal mistakes and recognition of them. Clinical mentors of residents, demonstrating by their

personal example, contribute to the formation of professionalism among residents. The formation of this competence occurs during the period of study through all disciplines of the educational program. This competency is assessed by direct observation, a 360-degree tool, and feedback from various sources.

The educational organization promotes the professional autonomy of residents by providing them with the opportunity for an additional type of training and the opportunity to participate in the organization of educational activities. Each resident is provided with a “Resident Privilege Sheet”.

Experts have established that the educational organization fully exercises autonomy in relation to the selection of residents for an accredited specialty in accordance with the state mandatory standard of residency in medical specialties and the standard professional training program for medical specialties of residency, approved by the order of the Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 4 July 2022 No. MOH RK-63, as well as the internal Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6, the Rules for admission to the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board CF "UMC" dated March 1, 2018 No. 5.

Also, the organization fully develops the educational program, determines approaches to evaluating residents (Instructions for the development of educational and methodological documentation and a system for evaluating the educational achievements of resident doctors of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre", Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" May 13, 2021 Protocol No. 2 as amended on September 15, 2023 Protocol No. 15). Responsible employees showed the experts a document defining the requirements for teachers of the residency program (clauses 53, 54 of the Rules for Organizations of the Educational Process in Residency of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre”). Every year, employees of the Department of Education carry out advisory work to resident doctors of graduate courses on issues of employment and working out a state educational grant in accordance with the Law on Education (Article 47.) and in accordance with the Rules for sending a specialist to work, reimbursement of expenses incurred from budgetary funds, granting the right independent employment, exemption from the obligation or termination of the obligation to work for citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan studying on the basis of the state educational order, approved by the order of the acting Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 11, 2023 No. 403. Graduates of the residency program of the CF "UMC" are employed in the clinics of the CF "UMC" and in leading medical clinics, such as JSC "National Centre for Neurosurgery", JSC "National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Centre", MSI on the REM "Hospital of the Medical Centre of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan", LLP “National Scientific Oncology Centre”, MSI on the REM “National Scientific Centre of Traumatology and Orthopaedics named after Academician N.D. Batpenov” Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as in regional multidisciplinary hospitals and clinics of the country.

To verify standard 1, a meeting was held with the head of the Department of Education, Alma Alibekovna Syzdykova. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: which units took part in developing the mission and goals of the educational program, whose opinions and suggestions were taken into account and how. During the answers, the director of the organization confirmed that all structural divisions of CF “UMC” took part in the development of the strategy and mission, the discussion also took place at the level of consultative and advisory bodies, incl. at the educational and methodological council of May 8, 2019 No. 3. In the CF “UMC”, the formulation of the mission statement and goals was based on the opinions and suggestions of employees, Academic staff, based on the results of a systematic survey and participation in round tables. Such events make it possible to identify the existing advantages and problems of all types of activities of the organization and thereby promptly develop action plans to eliminate shortcomings and improve.

The academic freedom of residents is manifested in the freedom to choose the subject of research and form their own conclusions, as well as the disciplines included in the CED, and is described in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation "University

Medical Centre" (Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6).

When conducting a survey of 80 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program. It was found that 78.75% (63 residents) would recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 67.5% (54 respondents) believe that educational program leaders and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 85% (68 people) of residents answered positively, 2.5% (2) are not sure about this, 6.25% (5 people) could not yet answer this question and 2.5% (2 residents) would like to believe it.

32 teachers were surveyed (21 survey questions) and also answered that 81.25% (26 people) are satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization, and 15.63% (5 people) partially agree with this statement. Experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees, responds promptly to requests and takes into account suggestions received through feedback and "360 surveys." In the questionnaire, 90.63% (29 teachers) are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 9.38% (3 teachers) are partially satisfied. According to 84.38% (27 respondents), in an educational organization, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, a total of 32 people responded (117 in total on staff), with teaching experience of up to 5 years - 21.88% (7 teachers), up to 10 years - 9.38% (3 teachers), and over 10 years - 68.75% (22 teachers).

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The final results of training in the residency specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" are defined and included in the Educational Program, which was developed by the team of the Clinical Academic Department of Surgery and approved by the Educational and Methodological Council (Minutes No. 5 of 04/27/2023). Informing stakeholders about the final results of training of residents in the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" is carried out through systematic surveys, questionnaires and participation in round tables. Experts are convinced that the professional behaviour and communication skills of residents are formed through the formation of competencies in the chosen field of medicine, as well as by choosing elective disciplines that complement and deepen the competencies formed by the disciplines of the compulsory component, ensuring the flexibility of the educational program with a focus on the needs of society and the priorities of the national system healthcare. All of the above is reflected in the syllabuses, educational program and individual curriculum and are reflected in the Rules of organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" and the Code of Business Ethics of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" (approved by decision of the Board No. 17 of December 26, 2022). Faculty and residents are informed about the code of ethics. You can view the contents of the code of ethics at the link https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1tak8k_vNzwglXzf-stVta16QlgZaT5HP.

The goals of educational programs are feasible and feasible. To achieve the final learning results, new educational technologies are being introduced into the educational process of the CF "UMC": CBL, problem-based learning (PBL), simulation training.

At each stage of training, competencies are clearly defined for each discipline and for each course in the specialty, due to which a staged formation is achieved competencies defined by residency programs.

CF "UMC" informs the public about the established final learning outcomes of PDL programs by posting on the official website of CF "UMC" the final competencies of a residency graduate, according to the State Compulsory Educational Standard for Residency. The criteria for assessing the level of competence development are also reflected in the syllabuses, which can be freely found on the organization's website.

When determining the final learning outcomes, employees of the Department of Education took into account previous learning outcomes in undergraduate and internship programs, and also took into account the goals and objectives of subsequent continuous professional development in the chosen specialty. The educational organization provides training in additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development), including programs in the specialty of an accredited educational program.

The surveyed teachers responded that 68.75% (22 people) were completely satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 28.13% (9) were partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The organization has developed 52 continuing education programs, including for specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY.” Residents are informed about this.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final results

In developing the goals and objectives of the educational program 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”, employees of the Department of Education and the Clinical Academic Department of Surgery took part, which is confirmed by the document - the educational program in the specialty mentioned above, extracts from the Minutes of the meetings of the Educational Methodological Council (Minutes No. 5 of 04/27/2023).

At the same time, when talking with residents and experts, they did not receive a clear answer to the question “Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program?” To these questions, the residents answered that out of all the resident students, two are members of the advisory bodies, on behalf of which all residents can convey their proposals and opinions on the organization of the educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 12, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1. To use innovative teaching methods in the learning process (Standard 1.1.5)
2. To involve all stakeholders in the process of developing the mission of the educational program: teachers, residents, employers (Standard 1.4.1)

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

The model of the educational program in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” is determined on the basis of the final learning outcomes of residents, therefore it includes the following: patient supervision, communication and collaboration, safety and quality, public health, research, training and development. Duration of training is 3 years. The consistency and transparency of training is guaranteed by the timely completion of assessment sheets for the implementation of practical skills, as well as the completion of a journal with assessments of current, intermediate and end-of-course assessment.

To implement the educational program in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY,” the organization’s documents contain EMCD, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with State Compulsory Educational Standards and standard requirements has been established, including compliance with the academic load, and the ratio of the volume of disciplines is maintained depending on the duration of study.

In accordance with the 2022 State Compulsory Educational Standards, the full academic load of one academic year is at least 70 academic credits (2100 academic hours). One academic credit is equal to 30 academic hours. The academic year includes one academic period, ending with an intermediate

assessment. Vacations are provided to students for at least 7 weeks, with the exception of graduation year.

Residency training includes classroom work, independent clinical work under the guidance of a mentor, and actual independent work student (IWS). The volume of classroom work is 10% of the volume of each discipline, independent clinical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor - 75%, IWS - 15%. The volume of theoretical training is no more than 20% of the curriculum...

Residency training includes classroom work, independent clinical work under the guidance of a mentor, and the student's own independent work. The volume of theoretical training is no more than 20% of the volume of the curriculum. Thus, the volume of the classroom is 10%, independent work under the guidance of a mentor - 75% and independent work of the student - 15% of the volume of each discipline.

The workload in the curricula for the specialty "General Surgery" in accordance with the training period of 3 years:

- the cycle of major disciplines is presented in the amount of 6240 academic hours or 208 credits, including:

- mandatory component – 6000 ac. hours or 200 credits;
- optional component – 240 ac. hours or 8 credits
- end-of-course assessment – 2 credits.

While attending a practical lesson on the topic "Master class on laparoscopic technology", volume 7.5 hours, the experts noted that the teacher was unable to provide a technical statement on the topic, syllabus.

The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since experts have studied the Code of Business Ethics of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" (approved by Board Decision No. 17 dated December 26, 2022) and during the interview, residents responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system, which is described in the Rules of Organizations of the Educational Process in the Residency of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Center," was evaluated. In total, there are 2 mentors in the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY", whose tasks are to promote comprehensive active professional development and equal distribution of clinical workload, provide resident doctors with patients, supervise clinical practice and control the performance of manipulations and operations, training through joint rounds, discussion of the plan examinations and treatment.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Job Descriptions of the Resident Physician (Approved by Decision of the Educational and Methodological Council No. 15 of September 15, 2023) and in the Resident Privilege List (Approved by the Director of the Department of Paediatric Surgery on September 1, 2023).

The qualification obtained as a result of completing the educational program in the specialty "GENERAL SURGERY" corresponds to level 8 of the national qualification framework (ESG 1.2) and has code 7R01115.

Teachers use such methods of teaching residents as lectures, seminars, journal club, grand round, discussion of a clinical case, simulation training, student work on preparing and passing the end-of-course assessment.

The list of teaching methods is described in the syllabuses. Through these methods, residents can participate in patient care. Faculty can provide resident supervision of approximately 3 case studies per day and 70 per month. In the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" there is requirements for the level of training of persons who have completed the residency educational program.

Experts have found that the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism are fully implemented in educational organizations. This is reflected in the Rules for organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre” and the Code of Business Ethics of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre” (approved by decision of the Board No. 17 of December 26, 2022). Academic integrity applies to areas of resident training such as completing independent assignments, taking exams, and writing articles, essays, and projects. And anti-plagiarism is applicable when residents are engaged in research work. Residents are trained to promptly collect informed consent from patients for any diagnostic and therapeutic procedures. The experts noted that the medical records contain a corresponding document signed by the patient.

Thus, by the end of the three-year training, residents will acquire the basic skills and abilities in the specialty “7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”, which will allow them to work in institutions such as hospitals of multidisciplinary or highly specialized medical organizations, research centres that have a hospital or specialized beds in the profile of General Surgery.

The experts did not establish any violations with respect to the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuous professional development, since the educational organization complies with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law on the Languages of the Peoples of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other regulatory legal acts in the field of education and healthcare. For example, an educational organization employs 117 people, of which 45% are women and 55% are men.

In the organization of education, there is a mechanism for regularly adapting teaching and learning methods to the requirements of modern science and education, as well as to the current needs of practical healthcare. This mechanism includes monitoring the timing of the last completion of advanced training courses in pedagogy, testing and communication skills of teaching staff and timely referral to training in new methods of teaching and assessing the results of educational achievements of residents. Moreover, the corporate fund has the Bitrix 24 portal, implemented as a cloud service. Bitrix 24 combines information (news, various groups) and communication (chat/video chat, mail, forums) services, and also has a common disk in which various documents necessary for residency training are stored, an organizer (calendar, planner, etc.) and etc.

This demonstrates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of tailoring training to the needs of residents. At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the Rules of organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre” and the Code of Business Ethics of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre” (approved by decision of the Board No. 17 of December 26, 2022), the organization does not have an anti-plagiarism system.

2.2 Scientific method

CF “UMC” is accredited as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activities for 5 years (Certificate series MK-000058 dated 03/09/2021). Employees of the CF “UMC” participate in the implementation of scientific and technical projects, involving resident doctors in scientific activities. The list of security documents received by employees of the UMC CF for 2023 is posted on the UMC CF website: http://umc.org.kz/?science=post#science_results.

List of scientific projects of the CF “UMC” for 2019-2023 is posted on the CF website «UMC»: <http://umc.org.kz/?science=post#projects>. The list of publications by CF “UMC” employees for 2019-2022 is posted on the website: <http://umc.org.kz/?publications=post>.

At CF “UMC”, the achievements of medical science are introduced into healthcare practice and into the educational process on modern methods of prevention, diagnosis and treatment of diseases.

Resident doctors participate in conferences at the republican and international level and make presentations on specialized specialties. The list of resident doctors and the names of conferences are indicated in the Appendix to the standard (the list does not include resident surgeons).

The residency educational program for the 2022 State Educational Standard includes mandatory disciplines in evidence-based medicine, research management and public health, and healthcare,

teaching how to search for reliable and high-quality information, differentiate it by degree of value and effectively use it in further clinical practice and research. Practical teaching of the basics of evidence-based medicine includes independent assessment of publications in various fields of medicine from the standpoint of analysing the design of a study, clinical analyses of patients built on the principles of evidence-based medicine, various analytical and research works aimed at teaching methods for searching and evaluating the results of clinical studies. Resident physicians are introduced to levels of evidence in medicine, monitoring issues, and aspects of clinical research. Approaches to assessing the value of scientific publications in terms of evidence, requirements for them, and rules for compiling systematic reviews, meta-analyses, and clinical recommendations are studied. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of a “journal club”, which is held twice a month.

When surveying residents, it was established that the educational organization has access to students’ participation in research work. 62.5% of the 80 respondents noted that they were already engaged in scientific work, 18.75% responded that they had started planning research work, 12.5% had not yet decided on a topic, 2.5% were not engaged.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program

Duration of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” is 3 years of study. In accordance with the 2022 State Compulsory Educational Standards, the structure of the EP consists of compulsory component (200 credits) and optional component (8 credits). Also, 2 credits were allocated for the end-of-course assessment. Thus, the labour intensity for training a surgeon is 210 credits.

The Department of Education is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process. For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”, the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of practical skills of residents - the presence of checklists for recording and assessing manual skills, the presence of a simulation class for training in the field of endoscopic surgery, the presence of a simulation centre at NUSM.

The organization of education ensures that the structure, content and duration of the educational program are adjusted in the event of any changes in different sciences, demographics, as well as in response to the needs of the health care system.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 72.5% of respondents completely agree, 16.25% partially agree, 7.5% completely disagree.

The organization has its own clinical base with 475 beds and 500 outpatient visits. A Joint Steering Committee was also created, which consists of the executive management of Nazarbayev University, UPMC (strategic partner University of Pittsburgh Medical Centre), and CF “UMC”. And to the survey question “*Is there enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)*”, 90% of residents responded with complete agreement, 5% partially agreed, 2.5% disagreed. At the same time, 73.75% of residents claim that after completing classes the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).

At the same time, to the question “Do representatives of residents participate in the development of educational programs?”, the experts received the following answer: management provides feedback during a 360-degree survey, two residents are members of the advisory bodies of the corporate fund. *The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (67.5%)*

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the Department of Education and conversations with the head and staff. At the same time, verification of standard 2 showed that CF "UMC" pays special attention to the issue of compliance with the requirements of international standards of quality and safety of medical care JCI, including through the use of methodologies for

continuous quality improvement, continuing professional development of medical personnel in leading medical organizations in the world, implementation of a patient-oriented system of medical care, including based on the recommendations of partner mentors from Switzerland in the field of hospital services.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including the work of the department of additional education, technology transfer, the work of all clinical departments, human resources services, the financial sector, the library, the simulation centre, a total of 24 meetings were held and, during cross-interviews, compliance with accreditation standards regarding the relationship was established education and medical care. Residents of the CF "UMC", being part of a team of clinicians, follow all the rules governing the provision of medical care at the organization's clinics. The Rules for the Organization of Postgraduate Education in the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre", approved by the decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" No. 6 dated March 29, 2021, define all the rights and obligations of participants in the educational process, including in the context of providing medical care.

Thus, responsibility for choosing the base of clinical training and practice for a resident in specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" rests with the Department of Education. Experts analysed information on the availability of accreditation of clinical sites and concluded that all clinical sites of the corporate fund have passed international JCI accreditation.

The training of residents in specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare. Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information about the number of residents and the organization of the educational process, and teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical departments - the departments of surgery, anaesthesiology and intensive care, internal medicine, laboratory medicine, pathology and genetics, radiology and nuclear medicine. Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with mainly elective surgical diseases

When attending a practical lesson on the topic "Endoscopic technologies in surgery", volume 7.5 hours and talking with residents, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

Integration between education and medical care (on-the-job training) is carried out through the direct participation of residents in the diagnosis and treatment of patients - self-examination of patients, under the supervision of a clinical mentor/head of department, independently or under the supervision of teachers performing medical manipulations, operations, management medical documentation, drawing up plans for examination and management of patients, participation in rounds and clinical discussions. Training is conducted in accordance with clinical protocols.

Of the 56 residents surveyed, 70% responded that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 10% believed that they rarely or sometimes.

The following employees took part in the planning, discussion, approval and review of the educational program in specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY": employees of the Department of Education, surgeons of the clinical Department of Surgery.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 22 standards correspond (including 19 basic, 3 improvement standards): completely - 19, partially - 3, do not correspond - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1. To develop unified teaching and learning methods (Standard 2.1.11)
2. To enter and reflect in the WC the component of your choice (Standard 2.3.1)
3. When planning, discussing, approving and reviewing an educational program, ensure due representation of all interested parties (Standard 2.4.4)

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT

3.1 Assessment methods

The study of control and measurement tools (50 tests, 30 situational tasks presented on paper) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. Residents also receive regular feedback from faculty. The system for appealing assessment results is reflected in the Instructions for the development of educational and methodological documentation and a system for assessing the educational achievements of resident doctors of the corporate foundation "UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER" (Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" on May 13, 2021. Protocol No. 2 (as amended on September 15, 2023, protocol No. 15)) and during the period of operation of the educational organization, there were no appeals. The assessment covers not only knowledge and skills, but also professional behaviour and communication skills, which is confirmed by the presence of assessment sheets for the implementation of practical skills, taking into account the above points.

The criteria for admission to the final certification are complete completion of the training program in accordance with the WC, IEP and portfolio. This is documented in the Rules of Organizations of the Educational Process in the Residency of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre".

Admission for independent examination of residents is the completion of a full course of training in accordance with the requirements of the Republican University of Pedagogics, IEP. The admission of resident doctors to the end-of-course assessment is issued by order of the supervising head of the CF "UMC" according to the list no later than two weeks before the start of the IA and is submitted to the certification commission. In the practice of educational organizations, residents (including other specialties) pass an independent examination in 100% of cases.

In the educational organization there is no unified system for validating and assessing the reliability of resident assessment methods (tests, tasks, cases).

Thus, to verify the data of standard 3, the experts asked questions to the Director of the Department of Education Alma Syzdykova, the heads of clinical departments and teaching staff regarding assessment methods during the current and final monitoring of the progress of residents and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents.

The organization has EMD, including EP, TW, IEP, CED, syllabuses, which are compiled by academic staff, employees of the corporate fund who conduct training in the residency specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY", employees of the Department of Education and approved at a meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council (minutes No. 15 of September 15, 2023). The head of the Department of Education responded that additions and updates to the control and measurement tools are planned to be made at the beginning of 2024.

The results of the resident assessment are documented in a paper journal, as well as using assessment sheets and stored on the Bitrix 24 portal.

There is a document on appealing the assessment results - Instructions for the development of educational and methodological documentation and a system for assessing the educational achievements of resident doctors of the corporate foundation "university medical centre", which was approved in 2021. To date, there have been no appeals from residents.

During the visit to the organization and interviews with staff, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, contracts with faculty and residents, job descriptions, resident privilege sheets, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and verifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for residents - Rules for admission to residency, Order on approval of teaching staff and clinical mentors in the specialty of residency, Rules for organizing the educational process in residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre", syllabuses, working papers curriculum, schedule, job descriptions of a resident physician, privilege sheets for all residency

programs, academic calendar for 2023-2024, and information on the procedure for selecting residents for internships, which is regularly updated.

During the visit to the organization, management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?” And the answer was received: “Yes, the practice of attracting external examiners to the CF “UMC” is provided for in the event of a final certification. To take a comprehensive exam, a Final Certification Commission is formed, which includes a chairman who is not an employee of the CF “UMC” Faculty of Sciences, who has an academic degree/academic title, and members of the commission from among the employees of the CF “UMC” Faculty of Sciences, with an academic degree of Doctor or Candidate of Sciences/degree Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or having the highest/first qualification category in the relevant specialty.” *The question was also asked: Are employees of clinical sites involved as examiners to evaluate the clinical training of residents? And the answer was received: “Until now we have not been involved, but we will be involved in the future.”*

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

When conducting interviews with 17 teachers regarding assessment methods, experts received convincing information that during the seminars, teaching staff use a point-rating assessment system, and the implementation of practical skills is assessed using developed assessment sheets. The results of assessing current, intermediate and end-of-course assessment are recorded in journals. Final progress is monitored using test tasks and situational tasks. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, counselling before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, residents said that after assisting, performing a manipulation or stages of an operation, the clinical mentor gives feedback on the same day and points out ways for improvement and improvement.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, test tasks, situational tasks, practical skills assessment sheets, and a simulation class.

Experts determined that the choice of methods for assessing residents is carried out in accordance with directive, external and internal regulations and is based on assessing the completeness and correctness of practical skills, since the practical part of training is the main one. For example, ongoing assessment methods such as verbal questioning, direct observation, evaluation of performance on simulation equipment, and assessment of activity in journal club and clinical education committees facilitate inter-professional learning. And a method such as assessing practical skills at the patient's bedside demonstrates the integration of training and an emphasis on clinical skills. Established assessment methods ensure that the resident has mastered all sections of the educational program and acquired the necessary practical skills.

Feedback from residents based on the results of their assessment is collected in the form of a questionnaire and stored in the database of the corporate fund, to which all teaching staff and residents have access. In interviews, residents confirmed that they receive feedback after completing their training.

At the same time, there are difficulties in the development of control and measurement tools, including the development of test items of the third level of complexity, automation of the assessment system and determination of validity.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 8, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1. To involve clinical site staff in evaluating residents (Standard 3.1.6.)

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

4.1 Admissions policy and selection

The educational organization has a policy for the admission of residents, which is called the Rules for Admission to the Residency of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” (Approved

by decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" on March 1, 2018 No. 5 Changes and additions: June 26, 2019 No. 14, March 5, 2021 No. 5, April 20, 2022 No. 5, April 28, 2023 No. 7).

Approaches to the admission of residents are based on country requirements and internal regulations. Transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to residency programs is achieved through the media and the provision of information on the website of the CF "UMC" (www.umc.org.kz, section "Science and Education - Residency"), which is confirmed in paragraph 2 of the document "Rules for admission to the residency program of the CF "UMC", approved by decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated March 1, 2018 No. 5.

The document takes into account the requirements for residency applicants in terms of their previous achievements in undergraduate and internship courses (for example, academic performance, foreign language proficiency).

The educational organization has created a barrier-free learning environment, including the presence of ramps, call buttons, elevators, and toilets for the disabled.

Approaches to the admission and transfer of residents from other educational organizations are reflected in paragraph 5 of the document Rules for organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre".

The appeal procedure based on the results of admission to residency is prescribed in paragraph 6 of the Rules for admission to residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre". To date, there has been no precedent for appeal.

Representatives of students were not included in the process of developing a policy for admission and selection of residents, and therefore it was recommended by the EEC to involve professional associations in the process of developing a policy for admission to residency.

A review of the admission and selection policy and the number of residents is carried out annually, and the Department of Education is responsible for this.

Thus, experts validated the data according to standard 4. In general, all criteria are met, at the same time, some shortcomings were identified, namely the lack of involvement of professional associations of residents in the process of developing residency admission policies. The experts familiarized themselves with the documentation for the admission of residents, including the Rules for admission to the residency program of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre". Many documents are well-written, but there are comments regarding approaches to admitting residents with disabilities, which may be due to the lack of this contingent of applicants. There are no documents confirming financial support for residents, although according to the administration this is being done. Experts found that there is no council of residents to solve their problems, there is information about the development of distance learning for residents, but in reality this is not carried out.

4.2 Number of residents

For the period 2019-2023 274 residents were admitted to all educational programs, including the program in specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" - 7 residents. The total graduation rate of residents on the dates of commencement of admission to residency in all specialties amounted to 683 people. Due to the fact that the enrolment of students in the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" was carried out for the first time in 2022, there were no graduates in this specialty earlier. The educational organization analysed the need in practical healthcare for surgical specialists and determined that the annual admission to the educational program in the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" will be 3-5 people. This indicator corresponds to resource capabilities. The Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan annually holds a meeting of the working group of the medical and economic council on medical education and science, where the volume of the state order for personnel training is discussed.

4.3 Support and counselling for residents

The practice of academic advising, personal support for residents and the development of not only professional skills were evaluated by experts through interviews and questionnaires of residents. When conducting interviews with residents and graduates, the following information was obtained: for the

entire period of residency training, each student is assigned a curator who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, in the selection of disciplines and teachers based on work with the catalogue of disciplines and working curriculum, supervises the clinical, educational and research activities of the student and mastery of practical skills. The curator also provides advisory assistance in resolving future career issues, determining the direction of research, choosing a supervisor, and determining the basis for industrial practice. Clinical mentors conduct educational work with the resident doctors assigned to them on issues of improving their academic performance, discipline and class attendance, and attracting them to participate in the public life of CF "UMC".

The educational organization has a resident development program, which includes a Journal Club, Program 024 to finance publication activities and presentations at international conferences, congresses and symposiums.

For the purpose of social support for resident doctors, CF "UMC" allocates appropriate resources. To do this, the resident doctor must write an application addressed to the head of the organization. If the head of the resident doctor approves the application with a request for financial assistance, a meeting of the budget or tariff commission of the CF "UMC" is held, at which the possibility of allocating the necessary funds is considered.

Financial support for residents is provided through the issuance of a scholarship in the amount of 100,036 (one hundred thousand thirty-six) tenge. Psychological support for residents is provided through counselling by psychologists in the psychosocial support sector with 6 staff positions. There is a room for psycho-emotional relief, where art therapy, music therapy and yoga classes are carried out.

Every year, employees of the Department of Education provide advisory work to graduate resident doctors on issues of employment and working out a state educational grant. The employment rate of graduates of all residency programs in 2022 was 100%.

4.4 Representation of residents

The educational organization has the following advisory and advisory body - the Educational and Methodological Council, in which residents participate - Tobyl A.S., resident doctor 3 years of study in the specialty "Paediatric Surgery", Mukhamedzhan G.B. "Obstetrics and gynaecology for adults and children." Also, the participation of students in decision-making about processes in the centres of the CF "UMC" is ensured through regular meetings of journal clubs, Grand rounds, topics for discussion at which are provided by the students themselves based on issues of interest to them in the department, in the centres of the CF "UMC", score 360 degrees.

When surveying residents, experts found that the opinions of resident doctors are taken into account to improve the educational process, which is reflected in the EMC protocol No. 6 dated July 20, 2018.

4.5 Working conditions

Residents receive a monthly stipend in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 10, 2022 No. 799 "On amendments to the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116 "On approval of the Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships for students studying in educational organizations" In total, the educational organization has 2 clinical bases for training surgical residents and at each site various events are held in which residents participate. For example, rounds in the department, morning medical conferences, providing assistance in departments, night/day duty as part of the duty team, consultations and conversations with patients and/or their relatives, a meeting of doctors to review clinical cases; consultations, reviews of incidents in accordance with international JCI standards, participation in the organization and conduct of scientific and information exchange events in the form of conferences, seminars, symposiums, forums and other forms aimed at exchanging experience, scientific and practical information, strengthening mutually beneficial ties, participating in joint scientific and research projects, as well as participating in the journal club with reports.

As a rule, residents supervise 3 patients per day, and 70 people per month. Residents make thematic reports as part of a journal club on methods of diagnosis and treatment of various diseases of the maxillofacial region. Participate in health education work.

The educational organization has introduced elements of distance learning for residents, but it is not used, the format and content of educational programs have been developed depending on the needs of practical healthcare, the Academic staff of the CF “UMC” has been trained in the use of distance technologies.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully - 15, partially - 5, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

1. To involve active residents in the process of developing residency admissions policies (Standard 4.1.6).
2. To develop a mechanism and document financial support for residents (4.3.2)
3. To consider the possibility of creating an informal association of students to solve problem situations (Standard 4.3.4).
4. To develop and implement a policy for resident representation in the development of mission and learning outcomes (Standard 4.4.1).
5. To create an organization of residents that will participate in making decisions about the processes, conditions and rules of training (Standard 4.4.2).
6. To develop a program for individual training of residents under special circumstances (Standard 4.5.5).

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

There are 117 employees in total, 3 in maxillofacial surgery, of which 3 are full-time teachers. The requirements for teachers of the residency program take into account the availability of a specialist certificate, degree, category, and work experience.

The degree of Academic staff conducting training in the residency specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” is 33.3%, 1 person (33.3%) has the highest category, 0 (0%) have the first category, 0 (0%) have the second.

The experts familiarized themselves with the job descriptions of doctors conducting residency training and the regulations on the Department of Education (Annex No. 7 to the minutes of the Board of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” August 01, 2023 No. 11 Approved by the decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” 01” August 2023 No. 11).

Experts are familiar with the personnel policy and policy regarding mentors in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre”. The ratio of teachers and residents is 1:3.

The motivation system for teachers and clinical mentors includes the following: timely delivery of continuing professional development courses at the expense of the CF “University Medical Centre”, motivation for publication activity and presentations with research results at international conferences and congresses within the framework of the 024 program.

In order to motivate teachers and clinical mentors, a gala event was held in March 2020 to reward UMC employees based on the results of educational and scientific activities for 2019. Based on the results of the competitive selection, the winners were:

1) in the nomination “Best Teacher of 2019” for additional education, the head of the gynaecology department of the Department of Women’s Health of the RDC - Imankulova Balkenzhe Zharkemovna;

2) in the nomination “Best Curator of 2019” - Head of the Department of Reanimation and Intensive Care of Newborns of the National Research Centre for Maternity and Children - Abentaeva Botakoz Abubakirovna;

3) in the nomination “Best resident-trainee of 2019” - resident doctor of 3 years of study in the specialty “Obstetrics and Gynaecology, including children’s” Madina Kanatovna Mustafinova;

4) in the nomination “Best resident-trainee of 2019” for scientific activities - resident doctor of 3 years of study in the specialty “Paediatric Surgery” Ardak Zhanarbekovna Suleimenova;

4) in the nomination “For the best scientific publication of 2019” - the head of the department of rheumatology of the Department of Paediatrics of the NRCMC, Mikesh Kuantaevna Asylbekova and the rheumatologist of the department of rheumatology of the Department of Pediatrics of the NRCMC, Mukusheva Zauze Serikpaevna;

5) letters of gratitude “For contribution to the development of educational and scientific activities of CF “UMC” were received by: Anzhelika Konstantinovna Meiramova - radiology doctor of the radiology department of the NRCMC; Bapaeva Gauri Ballakhanovna - Deputy Director for the Inpatient Department of the NRCMC; Murzabekova Gulnar Sarkytkazinovna - senior resident-consultant of the Department of Women's Health of the NRCMC; Lushchaeva Elena Vladimirovna is an obstetrician-gynaecologist at the Department of Women's Diseases of the Department of Women's Health of the NRCMC.

The principles of ethics and academic integrity of teachers are reflected in the Rules of “Coordination of Work for the Implementation of the Residency Program,” which spell out the responsibilities of the Department of Education, the director of the residency program by specialty, the clinical mentor and the teacher of the residency program.

When talking with teachers, they confirmed their awareness of the policy of recruitment, admission and motivation of teachers and clinical mentors, which includes academic experience and qualifications of a practicing specialist in the relevant fields of medicine, criteria for scientific, educational, pedagogical and clinical achievements; balance between teaching, research and clinical care; and also considers faculty-to-resident ratios sufficient for effective teaching and learning and monitoring of residents' academic and professional achievements.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes the presence of an academic degree, academic title, work as a full-time teacher or carrying out part-time activities, practical experience, scientific and teaching work experience. The conversation with teachers included such questions as knowledge of the mission and goals of the educational program, knowledge of modern teaching methods, the availability of feedback and evaluation of major disciplines and the educational program and allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting staff from clinical sites for teaching, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information security of the educational program, as well as identify problems in the management and development of human resources, for example, the lack of a rational balance between clinical work and teaching.

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority of 81.25% (26 people) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization, but 15.63% (5 people) were partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 87.5% (28 respondents) completely agree, 12.5% (4) partially agree. Satisfied with wages - 40.63% (13 people), dissatisfied with 21.88% (7). They note the possibility of career growth - 81.25% (26 people) completely agree, 18.75% (6 people) - partially agree.

5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during an interview with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes advanced training every 5 years in the specialty and pedagogy based on the annual Personnel Qualifications and Competencies Development Plan, which is developed by the Human Resource

Management Department. Various forms and methods of professional development for Academic staff are used: mentoring programs, courses, seminars, workshops, conferences, trainings, mentoring, distance learning, internships, etc. Professional development of personnel also includes internal rotation of employees, delegation of authority, mentoring and other tools development of competencies on the job. A unique opportunity to develop the potential of the Academic staff of the CF "UMC" is provided by budget program 024 "Targeted contribution to Nazarbayev University" by the subprogram "Technology Transfer". Every year, through funding within the framework of this program, more than 50 employees improve their skills in the best foreign centres, and mentoring programs and master classes are organized with the involvement of international experts. At the same time, Academic staff have the opportunity to improve their qualifications both in their clinical specialty and in developing competence in the field of research activities and methodology of medical education.

Experts determined that faculty and residents have adequate time for teaching, mentoring, and learning. The work schedule of teachers is established in accordance with the Rules of organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre". Opening hours: from 8:00 to 16:00. Teachers conduct seminars lasting 7.5 hours per week. Time for clinical reviews, clinical rounds - daily. Duty is happened twice a week.

The experts received answers about the program for advanced training of teachers, the educational program; they completed training for 2023, including teachers of the accredited educational program in the specialty 7R01115 "GENERAL SURGERY" - 3 people. These events are financed by the educational organization. The expert verified teachers' certificates on topics such as "Methodology and educational technologies in residency" (41 papers No. 105-kb dated 10/09/22).

Experts have found that teachers stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. CF "UMC" implements academic mobility programs for teachers and invitation of mentors in accordance with the goals and needs of students and employees. In order to motivate teachers, clinical mentors, and resident doctors of the CF "UMC", ceremonial events are held to reward UMC students and employees based on the results of educational and scientific activities.

In an educational organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 81.25% (26 people) of the surveyed teachers responded that they completely agreed with this statement, and 18.75% (6) partially agreed with this. Studied in professional development programs - 43.75% (14 people) less than 1 year ago, 34.48% (11 people) more than 3 years ago, 15.63% (5) more than 5 years ago and 3 13% (1 person) answered "I don't remember when it was."

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 40.63 (13)% answered that "yes, such programs exist," 6.25% (2) respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 34.38% (11 people) respondents do not know about this.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard improvement): fully - 4, partially - 4, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1. To develop and approve a policy for the recruitment and motivation of teachers and clinical mentors (Standard 5.1.1)
2. When selecting teachers, take into account the mission of the educational program, increase the level of teaching staff (Standard 5.1.2)
3. To develop and approve a system for evaluating teachers and mentors (Standard 5.2.3)
4. To develop a policy for recognizing teachers and mentors with material and non-material support (Standard 5.2.4)

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Logistics and equipment

Residents are trained on the basis of the National Research Centre for Maternity and Childhood, the Republican Diagnostic Centre, the National Cardiac Surgery Centre, the National Centre for Neurosurgery, including residents of the accredited educational program in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” on the basis of 8 clinical and academic departments. There are 475 beds in total. There are 3 training rooms, a large conference room with a capacity of more than 200 people, a second conference room for 50 people and a small conference room for 20 people, resident rooms in each department, a library with 34 seats, a computer class with 14 seats.

The experts visited the library, which provides residents and staff with access to the Thomson Reuters (Web of Science), Springer Link, OXFORD JOURNALS Medline, and Scopus databases. Total literature on the accredited specialty is 1736 pieces.

Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his training. The structure of the syllabuses did not correspond to the approved form. Residents noted that since the beginning of training the topics of scientific areas have not been determined; some still do not have topics.

The material and technical equipment of the corporate fund complies with international JCI standards, but there is a lack of equipment, simulators or phantoms for practicing practical surgical skills. During a conversation with representatives of the financial sector, it was found out that the application for the 2024 calendar year included financial resources for the purchase of the necessary equipment for the simulation centre to improve training conditions in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”.

Updating of the material and technical base, including the library background, is carried out every 5 years. So, over 5 years, the update affected the following: the fleet of computer equipment was updated, a computer class was created, a local computer system Bitrix 24 was created, and uninterrupted operation of the Internet was ensured.

6.2 Clinical sites

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical bases of JSC “National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Centre”, JSC “National Centre of Neurosurgery”, “National Scientific Research Centre of Maternity and Childhood”, “Republican Diagnostic Centre” were visited, and employees educational organizations ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff and management of the clinical site to achieve the final results of residents. There is an insufficient number of thematic patients (there are not enough patients for purulent surgery, emergency surgery, outpatient surgery to master the EP in surgery at existing bases). Advice was given to conclude an agreement with 1 CCH.

During a visit to the clinical base - the National Research Centre for Maternity and Childhood, Department of Surgery, experts examined the resources, their compliance with training programs, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for supervising patients, working with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in “Journal Clubs,” and the availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, because they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients and conducting international events.

There is a simulation centre with an area of 62.0 m² on the basis of the National Research Centre for Maternity and Childhood, equipped with equipment, including: a simulator for laparoscopy, hysteroscopy from Karl Storz, as well as resuscitation, obstetric, non-anthological and paediatric equipment. Residents of the educational program in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”

can practice practical skills: performing cardiopulmonary resuscitation, performing tracheostomy. Providing emergency care to patients with anaphylactic shock is also included in the training program. However, simulators and phantoms for practicing practical skills in surgery are limited.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, evaluation of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research work, and financing. Experts examined residents' documents (portfolios, resident assessment results, checklists, residents' survey results).

6.3 Information technology

Experts evaluated the access of residents and teachers to the necessary web resources, including the website of the corporate foundation, the Moodle distance learning website (not used), the database of educational information resources, which can be accessed from the internal network of the CF "UMC", the Paragraph information system, electronic library with full access to full-text databases SCIENCE DIRECT and SCOPUS (Elsevier), Web of Knowledge (THOMSON REUTERS), SPRINGER (SpringerLink) on the basis of Agreement No. 107 of June 19, 2017 between JSC "National Centre for Scientific and Technical Information", Almaty and UMC, as well as OVID CENTRAL, PUBMED, MEDLINE, EMBASE, BMJ Updates, ClinicalKey (Elsevier), COCHRANE LIBRARY through personal registration.

CF "UMC" has concluded international agreements for access to international databases.

Students have access to electronic media. Residents confirmed that they can use PubMed, Scopus, Springer, including when preparing for classes.

Information and communication technologies are represented by the following: local computer system Bitrix 24, personal information manager Microsoft Outlook, there is a video broadcast system in conference rooms, a subscription to the professional ZOOM platform. In order to create conditions for timely receipt of information by resident doctors, the following were created: a) a page on the social network Facebook, thanks to which resident doctors have the opportunity to follow news on residency programs and learn important events that occur at UMC; b) a single email in which all work curricula and plans, training schedules, duty schedules, vacation schedules, etc. are loaded important information. Each resident physician has login access; c) a WhatsApp group, which includes all group leaders, which allows you to quickly transmit/receive the necessary information; d) groups on the Bitrix24 Internet for resident doctors. Access to patient data and the healthcare information system is provided through Bitrix HIS (Hospital Information System). The resident supervises 5 patients per day, including completing the necessary documentation under the supervision of a faculty member. There is access to INFINITT, Laboratory.lnk, AIS "Polyclinic", ERSB (electronic database of inpatients), Registers of the assigned population and Register of pregnant women, Oncoregister, portals "Bureau of Hospitalization" and other information systems. For faster communication between workers within centres, most employees have portable communication devices (Dect).

6.4 Clinical teams

In order to develop the experience of working in a team among residents, the educational organization conducts such activities as direct work together with clinical workers of the centres of the CF "UMC" in all areas of their activity, discussion of tactics of management, treatment of patients in the department and participation in pathomorphological clinical and scientific and practical conferences, in various educational events, such as "Journal Club", "Educational and Clinical Commission".

Experts attended a journal club meeting, where the results of teamwork of residents in therapeutic specialties were presented. Inter-professional interaction is carried out through participation in the form of speech and discussion in the journal clubs twice a month and the clinical educational commission. Residents can conduct health education activities among patients and educational activities among interns.

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 90% of 80 respondents completely agree with this, 5% partially agree, 2.5% found it difficult to answer.

6.5 Medical research and advances

The educational organization carries out research work in such areas as: “Women’s health”, “Laboratory medicine, pathology and genetics”, “Paediatrics”. Over the past 5 years, progress has been made in the number of publications in peer-reviewed journals in the Web of science database; also in 2022, a grant was received from Pfizer for the educational project “Removing the burden of migraine in Kazakhstan”, in 2023 year, two projects of the CF “UMC” were financed by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Residents of all years of study are involved in carrying out scientific work (or fragments). They perform such types of work as collecting material, interpreting data, and statistical processing.

If residents carry out scientific and practical research, they are provided with access to instrumental and laboratory equipment.

An interview with 3 teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of case patients, time to maintain medical records, independent work). Due to the fact that the main clinical base of practice for residents is the National Research Centre for Maternity and Childhood, the population of patients supervised by residents is limited by age (mainly children) and nosology (elective surgery).

6.6 Educational expertise

Expertise in education includes the following areas - assessment by the Educational and Methodological Council, the use of a mechanism for expert assessment of educational programs, and the work of the quality management system service.

Employees of the Department of Education and the Educational and Methodological Council conduct annual monitoring of the quality of educational programs, the results of which are included in the minutes of meetings.

As part of the residency program review, an annual 360 survey is conducted (<https://umckaz.qualtrics.com/Q/MyProjectsSection?>). The survey includes resident doctors of the 1st, 2nd and 3rd years of study of all specialties. The assessment uses a 10 point scale.

The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. For example, the results of assessing the effectiveness of teaching methods and educational activities made it possible to include residency training in all specialties. Journal club and educational and clinical commission (Grand round) exist on an ongoing basis.

Resources for clinical training are updated annually and, based on the results of conversations with representatives of the financial sector, it was noted that in 2024 the simulation centre will be equipped with the necessary equipment for all residency programs opened in 2023, including specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”

6.7 Training in other institutions

The academic policy for resident training includes the possibility of training at alternative organizations if existing clinical sites do not cover all topics of the educational program. At the same time, the training of residents in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” is carried out mainly on the basis of the National Research Centre for Motherhood and Childhood, where there are Departments of Surgery with beds in the field of surgery, anaesthesiology and intensive care, therapeutic departments, with a total bed capacity of 475 beds. Residents study such disciplines of the educational program as “emergency surgery” and “purulent surgery” at City Clinical Hospital No. 2. The preparation of scientific publications is carried out under the guidance of a teacher and does not require additional training bases. However, residents can participate in academic mobility within the country.

There is a document on the transfer and offset of learning results between educational organizations: paragraph 5 of the Rules for organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation “University Medical Center”.

6 agreements and 19 memorandums were concluded with organizations, universities, associations, including JSC “National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Center”, JSC “Scientific Center of Neurosurgery”, State Enterprise at the PVC “City Multidisciplinary Hospital No. 2” of the Akimat of Astana, State Public Enterprise at the PVC “City Center for Phthisiopulmonology” of the Akimat of Astana. Memoranda have been concluded with foreign clinics in Ghana, Turkey, Israel, Italy, Slovenia, Lithuania, and Korea. During 2019-2023, at the expense of funds from the UMC CF, 26 resident doctors were sent to international conferences, forums, and congresses, 8 of them abroad. For example, in the specialty of the accredited educational program, international cooperation is carried out with Turkey, Lithuania and South Korea.

Teachers of educational organizations actively participate in republican and international events. Thus, 30 teachers took part in the mentoring program “Implementation of international standards in the management and implementation of residency programs.”

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 16, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To develop and implement mechanisms for motivating teachers to conduct research in the field of postgraduate education (Standard 6.6.2)

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring of the educational program includes questioning of residents, teachers, and residency graduates, which ensures transparency of the process and results. An annual analysis of the educational program will allow the educational organization to make adjustments and improve the content. Subsequently, the residency program was approved at a meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council (Minutes No. 5 of 04/27/2023). Regular evaluation of the quality of the educational program is carried out by the Department of Science and Education by monitoring and evaluating the educational program at all levels, using a competency-based approach and includes a system of evaluation forms “360 degree analysis”.

An evaluation of the process of implementing the educational program in view of the first intake of residents in the specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” in 2022 was carried out in 2023 after mastering the disciplines of the educational program by analysing the final learning results. For example, a survey of 39 residents of 1, 2 and 3 years of training in other specialties demonstrated the following in the framework of the “360 degree survey” using a 10-point scale: the maximum average value (8.77) among resident doctors is understanding the purpose and objectives of the training program and what is required of a resident physician; The vast majority of respondents noted the possibility of mastering the necessary practical skills in the departments of the clinic (8.10) and the provision of the program with the number and necessary profiles of patients in the departments of the clinic (8.08); 8.00 points allocated by resident physicians to provide sufficient practice to improve clinical knowledge and practical skills; an average score of 7.88 was noted on the question of sufficient responsibility for making decisions and managing patients in accordance with the level of training; Resident doctors rated the opportunity to participate in scientific events and research at UMC as 7.96 points.

A 2023 survey of 117 faculty members found that faculty clearly and accurately understand the purpose and objectives of the residency program. However, 28.6% of them find enough time and desire to effectively train residents. The survey results show that only 57.2% of residents are independent, 42.8% need supervision when communicating with patients and consulting.

Assessment of approaches to the admission of residents is carried out through feedback, surveys and questionnaires. All results of the surveys and the analysis carried out on it are presented to the EMC, based on the results of which corrective actions are proposed by council members.

The selection and compliance of teachers and teaching methods is also carried out through feedback from residents. For example, the results of a survey of 39 residents in 2023 showed that, assessing the level of effectiveness and informativeness of the educational activities of the residency program, 79.5% of respondents responded positively to the Journal Club and 72.2% to the seminars. Also, 59.5% of respondents note the effectiveness of using Practical Skills in improving skills and abilities. Assessing the level of interest of the teacher in training resident doctors, 60.5% of respondents responded positively, 10.5% responded negatively. As a result, only 59.5% of respondents expressed their satisfaction with the residency program. However, 73.7% of respondents rated the level of support and direction from residency staff as positive.

The evaluation of the sufficiency and quality of educational resources is carried out by the Department of Education. In the process of assessing the quality of residency educational programs, it was established that, along with the achievements (strengthening the program through the inclusion of Scientific work in a mandatory component, as well as through invited foreign teachers, internships with the possibility of participation of resident doctors at international and republican conferences, seminars), there is a number of problems and shortcomings, including the need to compensate for the absence of case studies by concluding contracts with third-party organizations, the lack of simulation equipment for practicing practical skills in the field of maxillofacial surgery, the lack of an automated electronic system for recording current, intermediate and final progress.

7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents

Educational organizations regularly collect feedback from teachers, residents, and employers.

To survey teachers, a questionnaire was developed that included 15 questions, rated on a ten-point scale and including three levels: (1) General evaluation criteria; (2) The level of effectiveness and information content of new educational activities; (3) Providing residents with various resources for training. The results of a survey of teachers conducted in 2023 showed that the average rating for three levels of questions was distributed as follows: (1) General evaluation criteria - 7; (2) Level of effectiveness and information content of new educational activities – 6.3; (3) Provision of residents with various resources for training – 7.7. The analysis showed that the teaching staff who participated in the survey accurately and clearly understand the purpose and objectives of the residency program. However, 28.6% of them find enough time and desire to effectively train residents. The survey results show that only 57.2% of residents are independent, 42.8% need supervision when communicating with patients and consulting.

The survey of residents is conducted once a year and is devoted to such topics as: the number and type of patients in the departments, responsibility for making decisions in the management of patients, the level of support and assistance from doctors, the level of effectiveness and informativeness of the educational activities of the residency program, access to modern literature and library, computer programs and simulation equipment, satisfaction with the residency program, level of support and referrals from residency department staff.

7.3 Resident and Graduate Outcomes

The results of residents and graduates are indicators of the quality of educational programs. Due to the first intake of residents in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY,” there are no final results of an independent assessment of residents.

Thus, the results of an independent assessment of residents in 2022 showed that among all examinees, 87.5% of residents received an “excellent” rating, 12.5% received a “good” rating. The highest rate is for residents in the specialty “Neonatology”, “Anaesthesiology and Reanimatology”, and the lowest rate is for residents in the specialty “Oncology and paediatric haematology”. An analysis of the end-of-course assessment results for three years revealed the following: the share of residency graduates who passed the final certification procedure and received “good” grades from the

total number of graduates in 2020 was 62.52%, in 2021 – 60%, in 2022 – 87.5 %, 2023 - 74.19%, and “excellent” in 2020 - 70.81%, 2021 - 65%, 2022 - 87.5%, 2023 - 64.41%.

Faculty evaluated the level of clinical training of residents in 2022 and 2023, noting positive dynamics in 2023 and better assessment results compared to previous years. Experts noted the following successes in the clinical training of residents: a direct correlation between the provision of residents with thematic patients, involvement in the treatment process and, as a consequence, knowledge of the features of diagnosis and treatment of nosological forms within the specialty being studied and successful assessments of the final certification; motivation of residents for scientific activities. At the same time, experts also identified shortcomings in the clinical training of residents, which include the lack of automation and transfer of many forms of evaluation and accounting from paper to electronic.

Since the entire process of training and monitoring of residents is concentrated in the Department of Education, the results of assessing the clinical practice of residents and graduates are immediately sent to responsible persons. Responsible for residency programs is director Alma Syzdykova. To improve the educational process, the following has been undertaken in the last 2-3 years: equipment for the simulation class, updating in accordance with changes in the State Compulsory Educational Standards of WC, IEP, syllabuses, and introduction of training activities such as “Journal Club” and Educational and Clinical Commission.

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

Educational organizations have approaches to involving teachers and residents in evaluating the educational program and monitoring its implementation. The members of the UMS include heads of departments, key persons in residency from among the Academic staff, and, depending on the agenda, other interested persons may be invited. In this way, we can provide maximum access to the results of the evaluation of residency programs of the CF “UMC” to all interested parties.

Thus, two residents are included in the advisory body “Educational and Methodological Council” and participate in the discussion of all issues of the educational process. The results of the evaluation of the educational program are announced at a meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council.

7.5 Procedure for approval of educational programs

The educational organization has established a system for documenting the educational process, including approval of the educational program, which includes the following: planning, approval at a meeting of the Educational Methodological Council, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes.

Stakeholders involved in the approval of the educational program are employees, students; employers (did not participate).

A system for monitoring the quality and compliance of clinical sites, material and technical equipment and educational resources has been developed and implemented, which includes the following: the creation and operation in each centre of the CF "UMC" of an internal quality assurance system - quality management and patient safety departments (QM&PS) under the leadership of the deputy Director for Quality Management and Patient Safety, whose responsibilities include planning and coordination, improvement of the management system, issues of improving the quality of services provided, including the educational process, and conducting internal audits.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 8, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement, identified during the external visit:

- 1) To involve employers in the monitoring and evaluation program of educational programs (Standard 7.4.1.)
- 2) To approve the residency program in collaboration with all interested parties (Standard 7.5.2)

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management

Residency training, including evaluation of the knowledge and skills of residents, is carried out in accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" (Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6) and Rules for admission to the residency program of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" (Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" on March 1, 2018 No. 5 Changes and additions: June 26, 2019 No. 14, March 05, 2021 No. 5, April 20, 2022 of the year No. 5, April 28, 2023 No. 7).

To implement the educational program, the educational organization has an organizational structure in which the educational sector is represented by clinical and academic departments and the Department of Education. The experts got acquainted with documents on the completion of training of residents in other specialties due to the lack of graduation of residents in the specialty "Maxillofacial surgery for adults, children" this year. A certificate of completion of residency is issued to residents who have completed the residency educational program in their chosen specialty and have successfully passed state certification, and contains information about the period of study, the name of the specialty of study and the awarded academic degree in the relevant specialty, indicating the code.

8.2 Academic leadership

The responsibilities and duties of the management and employees for postgraduate medical education are determined, which are assigned to the Board of the CF "UMC" (<http://umc.org.kz/about/pravlenie/>), the Chairman of which is Doctor of Medical Sciences, Pya Yuri Vladimirovich. Residency issues are under the supervision of the Deputy Chairman of the Board of the CF "UMC" Nurgul Kalieva Khamzina and are enshrined in Order No. 04-n/k dated 02/07/2023 "On the distribution of duties, areas of authority and responsibility between members of the Board and other officials of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre". Clinical and academic departments and the Department of Education are responsible for organizing residency programs. Transparency of management and decision-making in the educational process is ensured by discussing educational and methodological documentation, organizing the educational process for the residency program at meetings of the EMC and, after receiving their positive conclusion, it is approved by the supervising head of the CF "UMC". The official website of the CF "UMC" provides information on educational residency programs: information for applicants, class schedule, academic calendar, catalogue of elective disciplines, syllabuses, etc., which ensures accessibility and transparency of the educational process.

The educational organization evaluates the leadership of the educational process and employees regarding the achievement of the mission of the residency program, the expected final results of training by providing feedback to residents and teachers through questionnaires (see section 7.2 of the report), audits to assess the quality of the organization of the educational process.

To the survey question "Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, and clinical work," 84.38% of teachers answered that systematically, 9.38% answered "sometimes."

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The department responsible for planning and distribution of finances at CF "UMC", including residency programs, is the financial and economic department under the leadership of the managing director for finance in accordance with order No. 48-n/k dated May 24, 2018.

The managing director for finance oversees the following structures responsible for budget management, including residency programs: financial and economic department, accounting and finance department. The range of duties, responsibilities and powers are reflected in the job descriptions of employees of the corporate fund, approved by Order of the head of the organization No. 22-n/u dated 02.12.2019. Financial matters in CF "UMC" are handled by the financial and economic department under the leadership of the managing director for finance in accordance with order No. 48-n/k dated May 24, 2018

A financial plan is drawn up annually, including a target budget for training. The financial plan is in line with the strategic plan for the period 2019-2023. The most funds are spent on the purchase of simulation equipment, working equipment - equipment for surgical interventions, subscriptions to access international medical information resources. During a meeting with financial sector employees, experts found out that budget planning is carried out for the calendar year, taking into account the wishes and needs of all clinical departments and the Department of Education.

8.4 Administration and management

There is an appropriate administrative (10 people) and Academic (206 people) staff, including management.

Experts have established that the quality management system (QMS) includes regular internal and external audits, including those providing a residency program for processes. The quality and safety management department (QMS&PS) is responsible for the implementation and monitoring of the QMS. Teachers are aware of the QMS, which is confirmed during their interviews. An assessment of the administration and management of the educational process in general and the residency educational program in specialty 7R01117 “Maxillofacial surgery for adults, children” is carried out by identifying priority areas for improvement and carrying out quality improvement activities, identifying high-risk areas, and bringing them up for discussion by the Board of the CF “UMC” proposals on issues requiring management decisions of CF “UMC”.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The educational organization complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, in accordance with the classifier of residency specialties (On approval of the Classifier of areas of training for personnel with higher and postgraduate education Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569), in the organization of education at the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year. Each year, training is provided in 9 specialties. All educational programs are provided with relevant educational and methodological documents and teachers.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): 11 completely.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The procedure for updating the organizational structure is carried out as necessary. In connection with the changes in the State Compulsory Educational Standards, curricula and syllabuses for resident doctors have been revised, and internal regulatory documents are being revised to bring them into line with the new established requirements.

The educational organization annually allocates resources for continuous improvement. Evaluation and monitoring of the implementation of the educational program of the CF “UMC” residency also made it possible to identify such an area for improvement as the further development of teaching potential in the field of educational technologies. For example, in 2023, 43 residency teachers completed continuing professional development courses in educational technologies.

To purposefully improve the educational process, sociological research is carried out, including “Analysis 360”, and literature on postgraduate medical education is also studied. In the process of this analysis, approaches to teaching in residency were revised, and such teaching methods as “Journal Club” and “Educational and Clinical Commission” were introduced.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 Standard improvement): completely - 2.

CONCLUSION: When conducting an external assessment of the educational program, it was found that out of 114 standards (including 80 basic standards and 34 improvement standards), 95

accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 69 basic standards and 26 improvement Standards. 11 basic standards and 8 improvement standards have been partially met. No non-compliance with standards has been identified.

5. Recommendations for improvement of the educational program 77R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY”:

- 1) To use innovative teaching methods in the learning process (Standard 1.1.5).
- 2) To involve all stakeholders in the process of developing the mission of the educational program: teachers, residents, employers (Standard 1.4.1).
- 3) To develop unified teaching and learning methods (Standard 2.1.11).
- 4) Enter and reflect in the WC the component of your choice (Standard 2.3.1).
- 5) When planning, discussing, approving and reviewing an educational program, ensure due representation of all interested parties (Standard 2.4.4).
- 6) To involve clinical site staff in assessing residents (Standard 3.1.6.).
- 7) To involve more active residents in the process of developing residency admissions policies (Standard 4.1.6).
- 8) To develop mechanisms and document financial support for residents (4.3.2).
- 9) To consider the possibility of creating an informal association of students to solve problem situations (Standard 4.3.4).
- 10) To develop and implement a policy for resident representation in the development of mission and learning outcomes (Standard 4.4.1).
- 11) To create an organization of residents that will participate in making decisions about the processes, conditions and rules of training (Standard 4.4.2).
- 12) To develop a program for individual training of residents under special circumstances (Standard 4.5.5).
- 13) To develop and approve a policy for the recruitment and motivation of teachers and clinical mentors (Standard 5.1.1).
- 14) When selecting teachers, take into account the mission of the educational program, increase the level of teaching staff (Standard 5.1.2).
- 15) To develop and approve a system for evaluating teachers and mentors (Standard 5.2.3).
- 16) To develop a policy for recognizing teachers and mentors with material and non-material support (Standard 5.2.4).
- 17) To use distance learning methods where applicable (Standard 6.3.3).
- 18) To develop and implement mechanisms for motivating teachers to conduct research in the field of postgraduate education (Standard 6.6.2).
- 19) To involve employers in the monitoring and evaluation program of the educational program (Standard 7.4.1).
- 20) To approve the residency program in collaboration with all interested parties (Standard 7.5.2).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01115 “GENERAL SURGERY” with accreditation standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this program for a period of 3 years.

Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Signature
Chairman of the EEC	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	
Foreign expert	Ziganshina Liliya Yevgenevna	
Foreign expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	
Academic expert	Zhanteliyeva Lyazzat Asanovna	
Academic expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	
Academic expert	Idrisov Alisher Saugabaevich	
Academic expert	Ramazanovna Sholpan Khamzaevna	
Academic expert	Dolmatova Irina Anatolyevna	
Academic expert	Arinova Saule Pasevnoevna	
Academic expert	Karibaeva Dina Orynbasarovna	
Academic expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	
Academic expert	Menchisheva Yulia Alexandrovna	
Resident expert	Yerkinov Yerbolat	
Resident expert	Orynbay Aizere Sauletkyzy	

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of an educational program (summarization)

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of Standards	BS*/SI	Grade		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Does not compliant
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	14	9/5	8/4	1/1	0/0
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	22	18/4	16/3	2/1	0/0
3.	ASSESSMENT	9	5/4	5/3	0/1	0/0
4.	RESIDENTS	20	14/6	11/4	3/2	0/0
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY	8	7/1	3/1	4/0	0/0
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	18	11/7	11/5	0/2	0/0
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	10	7/3	6/2	1/1	0/0
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	11	8/3	8/3	0/0	0/0
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	2	1/1	69/26	11/8	0/0
		114	82/32		114	

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры

№	Наименования документов	Количество
1.	Силлабусы,	2
2.	Рабочие учебный планы	1
3.	Расписание	1
4.	Должностные инструкции врача-резидента,	1
5.	Листы привилегий резидентов	2
6.	Правила организаций образовательного процесса в резидентуре корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center”	1
7.	Инструкция по разработке учебно-методической документации и системе оценки учебных достижений врачей-резидентов КОРПОРАТИВНОГО ФОНДА «UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER»	1
8.	Образовательная программа «Общая хирургия»	1
9.	Порядок отбора и направления врачей-резидентов корпоративного фонда «UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER» на прохождение стажировки	1
10.	Положение об Учебно-методическом совете корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center”	1
11.	Правила приема в резидентуру корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center”	1
12.	Приказ об утверждении преподавательского состава и клинических наставников по специальности резидентуры корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center”	1
13.	Положение о Департаменте образования	1
14.	Договор о возмездном оказании услуг по проведению образовательных мероприятий по программе «Резидентура» корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center” Договор ННМЦ №ДО-2100 от 20.10.2023	1
15.	Договор о возмездном оказании услуг по проведению образовательных мероприятий по программе «Резидентура» корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center” Договор ННКЦ №ДО-730 от 30.08.2023	1
16.	Договор о возмездном оказании услуг по проведению образовательных мероприятий по программе «Резидентура» корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center” Договор с «ГКП на ПХВ городской центр фтизиопульмонологии» №994 от 26.04.2023	1
17.	Договор о возмездном оказании услуг по проведению образовательных мероприятий по программе «Резидентура» корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center” Договор с ГДБ №3 от ДНО-180 от 24.01.2023	1
18.	Договор о возмездном оказании услуг по проведению образовательных мероприятий по программе «Резидентура» корпоративного фонда “University Medical Center” Договор с ГБ 2 №ДНО-ДНО-129 от 19.01.2023	1